# Predicting and Estimating the Accuracy of n-ocular Optical Tracking Systems



M. Bauer, M. Schlegel, D. Pustka, N. Navab, G. Klinker Computer Aided Medical Procedures & Augmented Reality, Technische Universität München

5th IEEE and ACM International Symposium on Mixed and Augmented Reality ISMAR06, Santa Barbara (CA), USA, OCt. 22-25 2006

#### **Algorithm outline:**

- Compute fiducial location error (FLE) for every fiducial
- Rotate fiducial location error (FLE) into target coordinate system
- Compute marker target error (MTE) at the centroid in target coordinates
- Compute target registration error (TRE) at a point of interest in target coordinates
- Compute application-specific matrix norms

#### Estimation of the MTE from given FLE

- Marker Target Error (MTE): Error in the centroid of the target
- Use 3D/3D pose estimation algorithm to get  $R\vec{q}_k + \vec{t} = p_k + \Delta \vec{p}_k$
- Treat c as a random variable representing the error and build

$$J_{f}(\vec{q}) = \frac{\partial f(\vec{p}, \vec{q})}{\partial \vec{c}} \bigg|_{\vec{c}=\vec{0}} = \begin{bmatrix} 1 & 0 & 0 & q_{z} - q_{y} \\ 0 & 1 & 0 & -q_{z} & 0 & q_{x} \\ 0 & 0 & 1 & q_{y} - q_{x} & 0 \end{bmatrix}$$

with  $f(\vec{p},\vec{q}) = R\vec{q} + \vec{t} - \vec{p}$ 

# Estimation of the TRE from tgiven MTE

- MTE is given at the centroid, needs forward propagation to get the error at some point of interest
- Use again



#### Estimation of the FLE from given IPE:

- Assume that all errors are covered in some Gaussian unbiased noise on the image planes
- Use error propagation based only on the geometric constellation of the cameras
- From p:  $\vec{u_1} = \rho_1 K_1 T_1 \vec{x}$

 $\vec{u_n} = \rho_n K_n T_n \vec{x}$ 

compute 
$$\Sigma_{\vec{c}} = \begin{pmatrix} M^T \begin{bmatrix} R^T \Sigma_{p_1} R & 0 \\ & \ddots \\ 0 & R^T \Sigma_{p_n} R \end{bmatrix}^{-1} M \end{pmatrix}^+$$
 with

C++ code analytically generated with Mathematica

 $\therefore \qquad \Delta x = M \Delta x$ • This maps the 6D MTE to the 3D FLEs =  $\int J_f(q_n)$  $\lfloor \Delta p_n \rfloor$ 

Using the backward propagation formula, we get

 $\Sigma_{ec{c}} = \left( egin{array}{c} M^T egin{bmatrix} R^T \Sigma_{p_1} R & 0 \ & \ddots & \ 0 & R^T \Sigma_{p_n} R \end{bmatrix}^{-1} M 
ight)^T$ 

where  $R^T \Sigma_{p_{\nu}} R$  is the FLE in the target coordinate system • MTE is given in the target coordinate system

Experimental Estimation of IPE

- Small baseline: 20 cm
- 4x4 grid of fiducial points
- Resulting error magnified by factor 50
- Assuming unbiased Gaussian noise
- Artifacts due to discretization in tracking algorithms



Image plane error (IPE): Gaussian error on the image plane (2DoF).



Fiducial Location Error (FLE): How good can we determine the location of the fiducials in space (3DoF)



#### and compute

 $\Sigma_{\vec{p}} = J_f \Sigma_{\vec{c}} J_f^T$ 

 Resulting error at the point of interest is the sum of the translational part in the MTE at the centroid and the propagated angular part in the MTE

#### **Orientation matters:**

- Significant unisotropic behavior in both
   FLE error and error propagation
- Example path with propagation:
- Same FLE over whole path
- Significant differences in the resulting TRE
- Try not to amplify already large errors!





## Demo Setup



Target Registration Error (TRE): What is the final error at the point of interest (3DoF)?

#### **Example Setups**

2					$\ominus$	>>	2		$\square$	A	$\square$		A	2						8
1			Ø	Ø	Ø	Ф	1							1	Ð	P	Ø	Ø	$\bigotimes$	Ф
-	Ø		Ø	Ø	$\Theta$	$\bigoplus$		ð	ð	$\bigcirc$			$\bigcirc$		ð	P	Ø	$\bigotimes$	Ø	
0	9	Ø	$\bigotimes$	$\bigotimes$		Ø	0	Ø	Ø	$\bigotimes$	$\bigotimes$	$\bigoplus$	Ø	0	Ø	Ø	Ø	Ø		
-	0	Ø		$\oplus$				•	Ø				Ø ¥		4	Ø	Ø			
-1	0	<b>1</b> 0	•	Ð	Ø	æ	-1	0	<b>1</b> 0	•	Ð	Ø	۵P	-1	0	Ka				
-			0		1			1		0		1			-1		0		1	

# be detected (6DoF)?



## **Comparison with the state of the art**

- TRE (Fitzpatrick et.al. 1998) is de facto standard
- Assume FLE is given
- d<sub>k</sub> is distance of the point of interest
   from the k-th principal axis
- f<sub>k</sub> is RMS distance of the fiducials from the k-th principal axis



- How can we estimate the fiducial location error (FLE)?
  - Experiments
  - Data sheets from the tracking system manufacturer
  - "Magic numbers" from the tracking software
  - □ → We propose an analytical model
- Are the assumptions correct?
  - "This application assumes that […] the fiducial measurement error is identical, independent, zero-mean, and isotropic.







[...] Generally FLE is slightly anisotropic, with error along the optical axis of the OPS higher than error perpendicular to this axis."



Error propagation using full covariance matrices

 → We propose using general covariance matrices

• For comparison, use an FLE error with same RMS, but not assuming independence and isotropy

• Example target: Commercial pointer with four balls, POI about 15 cm from centroid

Initial RMS: 0.125953 mm, sqrt of eigenvalues: {0.07272} vs. {0.11023, 0.05083, 0.03363}

Resulting RMS at the tip: 0.172376 mm with sqrt of eigenvalues {0.09952} for the TRE vs. 0.202958 mm with sqrt of eigenvalues {0.182091, 0.0863337, 0.0241093} for the proposed method.

M. Bauer, M. Schlegel, D. Pustka, N. Navab, G. Klinker

**Predicting and Estimating the Accuracy of n-occular Optical Tracking Systems** The Fifth IEEE and ACM International Symposium on Mixed and Augmented Reality, Santa Barbara, CA, USA, Oct. 22 - 25, 2006.



- 1. W. Hoff and T. Vincent. Analysis of head pose accuracy in augmented reality.
- In IEEE Transactions on Visualization and Computer Graphics, volume 6(4), pages 319–334, 2000)
- 2. *M. Fitzpatrick, J. B. West, and C. R. Maurer. Jr.* **Predicting error in rigid-body, point-based registration**. IEEE Transactions on Medical Imaging, 17(5):694–702, 1998.
- 3. *B. D. Allen and G. Welch.* A general method for comparing the expected performance of tracking and motion capture systems. Proc. of Virtual reality software and technology VRST 2005

CAMP&AR | Chair for Computer Aided Medical Procedures & Augmented Reality | http://campar.in.tum.de | Technische Universität München